

**DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA
OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS**

Marion S. Barry Jr. Building
441 Fourth Street, NW, Suite 450 North
Washington, DC 20001-2714

TEL: (202) 442-9094 · FAX: (202) 442-4789 · EMAIL: oah.filing@dc.gov
eFiling: <https://ecourt.oah.dc.gov/public-portal/>

HARRY GURAL,
Tenant/Petitioner,

v.

EQUITY RESIDENTIAL/ SMITH PROPERTY
HOLDINGS VANNESS LP,
Housing Provider/Respondent.

Case No.: 2016-DHCD-TP 30,855

In re: 3003 Van Ness Street, NW
S-707

**ORDER GRANTING IN PART AND DENYING IN PART
HOUSING PROVIDER’S MOTION IN LIMINE**

This matter is before me on Housing Provider/Respondent Equity Residential/Smith Property Holdings Vannes LP’s Motion in limine filed on January 23, 2024. For the reasons stated below, the Motion is granted in part and denied in part.

In its Motion, Housing Provider seeks to exclude two classes of exhibits proposed by Tenant/Petitioner Harry Gural. In particular, Housing Provider argues (1) that proposed exhibits 129, 625, 631, and 639-652¹ should be excluded because they are irrelevant and (2) that proposed exhibits 148-58 should be excluded because they are irrelevant, duplicative and cumulative, and constitute hearsay.

In contested cases such as this, “[a]ny oral and any documentary evidence may be received, but the [ALJ] shall exclude irrelevant, immaterial, and unduly repetitious evidence.”² Hearsay evidence is generally admissible in contested case hearings,³ but it must be carefully evaluated to

¹ Some of the exhibit numbers assigned by Mr. Gural were already assigned to exhibits proposed by Housing Provider and a group of those exhibits were the subject of Mr. Gural’s motion to append his exhibit list, which was filed on January 16, 2024, after the deadline for identifying exhibits and witnesses. For these reasons, the exhibits subject to the motion to append were renumbered, as identified in Attachment A to this Order.

² D.C. Official Code § 2-509(b).

³ *Id.*; OAH Rule 2821.12.

determine the weight that is due.⁴ To be relevant, evidence must “tend[] to make the existence or nonexistence of a fact more or less probable than would be the case without that evidence.”⁵

Because Housing Provider’s Motion was filed the day before the evidentiary hearing was scheduled to take place, I invited argument regarding the Motion before commencing the evidentiary hearing on January 24, 2024. At that time, Mr. Gural stipulated to the exclusion of the following proposed exhibits: 129, 148, 151, 152, 153, 154, 156, 157, and 158. The Motion is thus granted with respect to those proposed exhibits, and they are excluded from the record.

With respect to proposed exhibits 625, 631, and 639-650, those proposed exhibits constitute Notices to Tenant of Adjustment in Rent Charged addressed to various tenants – but not Mr. Gural – at the Housing Accommodation located at 3003 Van Ness, NW. The Rental Housing Commission remanded this matter to me on two issues: (1) Tenant’s claim that the rent increase was larger than the increase allowed by any applicable provision of the Rental Housing Act (the Act); and (2) whether Housing Provider retaliated against Tenant with respect to its lease renewal and eviction policies or practices. Notices to Tenant of Adjustment in Rent Charged regarding housing accommodations in the same building where Tenant lives – but not addressing the rent for his apartment – are irrelevant to either of the two issues on remand. The rental increases in other apartments do not tend to prove or disprove in any way the amount of increases in Mr. Gural’s rent during the time period applicable to this case. Neither do Notices to Tenant of Adjustment in Rent Charged addressed to other tenants tend to prove or disprove Mr. Gural’s claims that Housing Provider’s lease renewal and eviction policies or practices constituted retaliation against him personally. I therefore find those proposed exhibits to be irrelevant to the issues remanded to me and exclude those exhibits.

With respect to exhibits 651 and 652, those documents are worksheets listing changes in rents charged for 2015 and 2016. Each document includes itemization of the increase in rent charged for the apartment occupied by Mr. Gural. Because one issue before me is Mr. Gural’s claim that the rent increase was larger than the increase allowed by any applicable provision of the Act, those documents are relevant in that they tend to prove or disprove a fact material to the issues before me – that is, the amount of Mr. Gural’s rent and the amount of any increases in his rent

⁴ See *District of Columbia v. Pub. Serv. Comm’n*, 802 A.2d 373, 379 (D.C. 2002) (administrative law judge has “greater discretion than trial judges in determining the admissibility of evidence”).

⁵ *Butts v United States*, 822 A.2d 407, 413 (D.C. 2003).

during the time frame applicable to this case. Housing Provider's Motion is therefore denied with respect to exhibits 651 and 652.

With respect to proposed exhibits 149, 150, and 155, those exhibits constitute three emails from residents expressing support for Mr. Gural's work as tenant association president. The documents are not cumulative or duplicative. Although they address the same subject, there are only three of them and I do not find them cumulative or duplicative. While the documents constitute hearsay, as noted above, hearsay is admissible in contested cases such as this. If admitted into evidence at hearing, it is my responsibility, as the presiding ALJ, to determine what weight to afford the evidence. Finally, these documents may tend to prove or disprove Mr. Gural's claims that Housing Provider's lease renewal and eviction policies or practices constituted retaliation against him personally. For these reasons, Housing Provider's Motion is denied with respect to exhibits 149, 150, and 155, and they are not excluded.

Accordingly, **IT IS HEREBY ORDERED:**

1. Housing Provider's Motion in Limine is granted in part as follows:
 - a. Tenant/Petitioner's proposed exhibits 129, 148, 151, 152, 153, 154, 156, 157, and 158 are excluded by stipulation of the parties;
 - b. Tenant/Petitioners proposed exhibits 625, 631, and 639-650 are excluded;
2. Housing Provider/Respondent's Motion in Limine is denied in part as follows:
 - a. Tenant/Petitioner's proposed exhibits 149, 150, 155, 651, and 652 are not excluded.

This Order is dated when it is served, as certified on the Certificate of Service found at the end of this document.

/s/ M. Colleen Currie
M. Colleen Currie [Electronically signed]
Administrative Law Judge

Certificate of Service:

By First-Class Mail (Postage Prepaid):

Harry Gural
3003 Van Ness Street, NW, Apt. S-707
Washington, DC 20008
Email: harrygural@gmail.com

Natasha N. Mishra, Esq.
Spencer B. Ritchie, Esq.
Gwynne L. Booth, Esq.
Richard Luchs, Esq.
GREENSTEIN DELORME & LUCHS, PC
801 17th Street, NW Suite 1000
Washington, DC 20006
Email: nmm@gdllaw.com
Email: sbr@gdllaw.com
Email: rwl@gdllaw.com

Equity Residential/ Smith Property Holdings VanNess LP
3003 Van Ness Street, NW
Washington, DC 20008

I hereby certify that on January 25, 2024 this document was caused to be served upon the above-named parties at the addresses and by the means stated.

 C. Draughn /S/
Clerk / Deputy Clerk

ATTACHMENT A

EX #	NEW EX #	ITEMIZED DESCRIPTION	
		TENANT/PETITIONER EXHIBITS	
100		Other:Tenant Petition/Complaint, TP 30,855, Harry Gural vs. Equity Residential (Aug. 30, 2016)	
101		Other:Decision and Order, DC Rental Housing Commission, Harry Gural vs. Equity Residential Management and Smith Property Holdings Van Ness LP, RH-TP-16-30,855 (Feb. 18, 2020)	
102		Other:Decision and Order, District of Columbia Rental Housing Commission, Gabriel Fineman vs. Smith Property Holdings Van Ness LP, RH-TP-16-30,842 (Jan. 18, 2018)	
103		Other:Final Order, DC Superior Court, District of Columbia vs. Equity Residential Management, 2017-CA- 008334-B (Oct. 8, 2021)	
104		Other:Judgement and Order on Remedies, DC Superior Court, District of Columbia vs. Equity Residential Management, 2017-CA-008334-B (Oct. 8, 2021)	
105		Other:Order Denying Housing Provider's Motion for Summary Judgment, Judge Colleen Currie, Office of Administrative Hearings, Harry Gural vs. Equity Residential Management and Smith Property Holdings Van Ness LP, 2016-DHCD-TP-30,855 (May 2, 2023)	

EX #	NEW EX #	ITEMIZED DESCRIPTION	
105		Other:TransUnion: Build your credit with Equity Residential flyer	
106		Other:Order Denying in Part and Granting in Part Tenant/Petitioner's Motion for Discovery, Judge Colleen Currie, Office of Administrative Hearings, Harry Gural vs. Equity Residential Management and Smith Property Holdings Van Ness LP, 2016- DHCD-TP-30,855 (Oct.	
107		Other:Tenant Opposition to Housing Provider's Motion for Summary Judgment, Harry Gural vs. Equity Residential Management and Smith Property Holdings Van Ness LP, 2016- DHCD-TP-30,855 (Nov. 4, 2016)	
108		Other:Tenant's Motion for Summary Judgment, Harry Gural vs. Equity Residential Management and Smith Property Holdings Van Ness LP, 2016- DHCD-TP-30,855 (March 3, 2017)	
109		Other:Tenant's Post-Hearing Brief and Closing Arguments (on Retaliation), Harry Gural vs. Equity Residential Management and Smith Property Holdings Van Ness LP, 2016-DHCD- TP-30,855 (July 29, 2017)	

EX #	NEW EX #	ITEMIZED DESCRIPTION	
110		Other: Tenant's Notice of Appeal to the DC Rental Housing Commission, Harry Gural vs. Equity Residential Management and Smith Property Holdings Van Ness LP, RH-TP-16- 30,855 (Sept. 28, 2017)	
111		Other: Brief of Appellant/Tenant to the DC Rental Housing Commission, Harry Gural vs. Equity Residential Management and Smith Property Holdings Van Ness LP, RH-TP-16-30,855 (March 4, 2019)	
112		Other: Verified Complaint for Possession of Real Property, Equity Residential v Harry Gural, Landlord and Tenant Branch of DC Superior Court, case LTB- 2016-10863 (Apr. 25, 2016)	
113		Other: Protective Order Information Sheet, Equity Residential v Harry Gural, Landlord and Tenant Branch of DC Superior Court, case LTB-2016-10863, Judge John Campbell (May 19, 2016)	

EX #	NEW EX #	ITEMIZED DESCRIPTION	
114		Other:Equity Residential motion to Vacate Drayton stay, Equity Residential v Harry Gural, Landlord and Tenant Branch of DC Superior Court, case LTB-2016-10863 (Aug. 23, 2016)	
115		Other:Court docket and account – Equity Residential vs. Harry Gural, Landlord and Tenant Branch of DC Superior Court	
116		Other:Account statement, \$49,319.92, www.MyEquityApartments.com for Harry Gural (Dec. 14, 2023)	
117		Other:Lease for Apt. S-707, Apr. 1, 2014 to March 31, 2015 (March 2, 2014)	
118		Other:Unsigned lease for Apt. S-707, Apr. 1, 2015 to March 31, 2016 (Feb. 17, 2015)	
119		Other:Affidavit by Harry Gural of actions taken that are protected from retaliation under the Rental Housing Act (May 15, 2017)	
120		Other:Affidavit by Avis Duvall (Oct. 21, 2016)	
121		Other:Wells Fargo checking account statement, Harry Gural (Jan. 28, 2015)	
122		Other:Wells Fargo checking account statement, Harry Gural (Feb. 26, 2015)	
123		Other:Wells Fargo checking account statement, Harry Gural (Jan. 28, 2016)	
124		Other:Wells Fargo checking account statement, Harry Gural (Feb. 25, 2016)	
125		Other:Certificate of Notice to RAD of Adjustments in Rent Charged, Smith Property Holdings Van Ness LP, 3003 Van Ness (Jan. 15, 2015)	

EX #	NEW EX #	ITEMIZED DESCRIPTION	
126		Other:Certificate of Notice to RAD of Adjustments in Rent Charged, Smith Property Holdings Van Ness LP, 3003 Van Ness (Jan. 15, 2016)	
127		Other:Housing Provider's Notice to Tenant of Adjustment in Rent Charged, Equity Residential to Harry Gural (Jan. 1, 2015)	
128		Other:Housing Provider's Notice to Tenant of Adjustment in Rent Charged, Equity Residential to Harry Gural (Jan. 1, 2016)	
129		Other:Housing Provider's Notice to Tenant of Adjustment in Rent Charged, falsified rents, 20 residents of 3003 (names redacted)	EXCLUDED BY STIPULATION
130		Other:Pricing for apartments at 3003 Van Ness, downloaded from Equity Residential website https://www.equityapartments.com/washington-dc/van-ness/3003-van-ness-apartments (May 19, 2016)	
131		Other:Apartment directly across the hall from the Tenant's apartment, identical layout, refurbished	
132		Other:Email from Harry Gural to Equity Residential Leasing Agent Merci Kearney (March 17, 2014)	
133		Other:Email from Equity Residential Leasing Agent Merci Kearney to Harry Gural (March 17, 2014)	
134		Other:Email from Harry Gural to Equity Residential Leasing Agent Merci Kearney (March 17, 2014)	
135		Other:Email from Equity Residential Leasing Agent Merci Kearney to Harry Gural (March 18, 2014)	

EX #	NEW EX #	ITEMIZED DESCRIPTION	
136		Other:Email from Harry Gural to Equity Residential General Manager Avis Duvall, Regional Manager Jesse Jennell and Leasing Agent Merci Kearney regarding the 2015 rent increase on his apartment. (Jan. 1, 2015)	
137		Other:First email from Equity Residential Leasing Agent Merci Kearney to Harry Gural, copied to Avis Duvall and Jesse Jennell (Feb. 9, 2015)	
138		Other:Second email from Equity Residential Leasing Agent Merci Kearney to Harry Gural, copied to Avis Duvall and Jesse Jennell (Feb. 9, 2015)	
139		Other:Email from Harry Gural to Equity Residential General Manager Avis Duvall regarding the 2016 rent increase on his apartment (March 15, 2016)	
140		Other:Email from Harry Gural to Equity Residential General Manager Avis Duvall regarding the 2016 rent increase on his apartment (March 30, 2016)	
141		Other:Email from Equity Residential General Manager Avis Duvall to Harry Gural regarding the 2016 rent increase on his apartment (Apr. 1, 2016)	
142		Other:Another email from Equity Residential General Manager Avis Duvall to Harry Gural regarding the 2016 rent increase on his apartment (Apr. 1, 2016)	
143		Other:Email from Harry Gural to Equity Residential General Manager Avis Duvall stating that Equity cannot force him to sign a lease (Apr. 1, 2016)	

EX #	NEW EX #	ITEMIZED DESCRIPTION	
144		Other:First email from Equity Residential General Manager Avis Duvall to Harry Gural regarding his last lease (May 3, 2016)	
145		Other:Second email from Equity Residential General Manager Avis Duvall to Harry Gural regarding his last lease (May 3, 2016)	
146		Other:Email from Equity Residential General Manager Avis Duvall to Harry Gural attaching his lease for the period covering April 2014 to March 2015 (May 6, 2016)	
147		Other:Email from Equity Residential General Manager Avis Duvall to Harry Gural regarding 2016 rent increase on his apartment (May 13, 2016)	
148		Other:Email from David Wilson, resident of 3003 Van Ness, expressing support for Harry Gural's work as tenant association president (May 22, 2017)	EXCLUDED BY STIPULATION
149		Other:Email from Calvin Lee, resident of 3003 Van Ness, expressing support for Harry Gural's work as tenant association president (May 17, 2017)	
150		Other:Email from Arai Monteforte, resident of 3003 Van Ness, expressing support for Harry Gural's work as tenant association president (May 15, 2017)	
151		Other:Email from Daisy Chung, resident of 3003 Van Ness, expressing support for Harry Gural's work as tenant association president (May 15, 2017)	EXCLUDED BY STIPULATION
152		Other:Email from Mary Jane Maxwell, resident of 3003 Van Ness, expressing support for Harry Gural's work as tenant association president (May 16, 2017)	EXCLUDED BY STIPULATION

153		Other:Email from Katie and Nick Pettet, resident of 3003 Van Ness, expressing support for Harry Gural's work as tenant association president (May 23, 2017)	EXCLUDED BY STIPULATION
154		Other:Email from Dee Fosherari, resident of 3003 Van Ness, expressing support for Harry Gural's work as tenant association president (May 23, 2017)	EXCLUDED BY STIPULATION
155		Other:Email from Sarah Pleznac, resident of 3003 Van Ness, expressing support for Harry Gural's work as tenant association president (May 17, 2017)	

156		Other:Email from Shirley Adelstein, resident of 3003 Van Ness, expressing support for Harry Gural's work as tenant association president (May 16, 2017)	EXCLUDED BY STIPULATION
157		Other:Email from Ben Serinsky, resident of 3003 Van Ness, expressing support for Harry Gural's work as tenant association president (May 17, 2017)	EXCLUDED BY STIPULATION
158		Other:Email from Amelia Finch, resident of 3003 Van Ness, expressing support for Harry Gural's work as tenant association president (May 17, 2017)	EXCLUDED BY STIPULATION
159		Other:Email from Equity Residential Regional Manager Jesse Jennell to Harry Gural regarding rent increase for Charlie and Amelia Finch (May 12, 2015)	
160		Other:Email from Equity Residential Regional Manager Jesse Jennel to Harry Gural regarding rent increase for Chary Annaberdiev (Oct. 1, 2015)	
161		Other:Email from Equity Residential General Manager Avis Duvall to Harry Gural regarding rent increase for Pat Remick (Oct. 1, 2015)	

EX #	NEW EX #	ITEMIZED DESCRIPTION	
162		Other:Email from Equity Residential General Manager Avis Duvall to Harry Gural regarding rent increase to Chary Annaberdiev (Oct. 2, 2015)	
163		Other:Email from Equity Residential Regional Manager Jesse Jennell to Charlie Finch and copied to Harry Gural regarding rent for Charlie and Amelia Finch (May 13, 2016)	
164		Other:Email from Equity Residential Regional Manager Jesse Jennell to Harry Gural regarding rent increase for Charlie and Amelia Finch (May 13, 2016)	
165		Other:Email from Equity Residential Regional Manager Jesse Jennell to Harry Gural regarding rent increase for Justin and Emma Pennisi (May 13, 2016)	
166		Other:Tenant Request to Housing Provider for Production of Documents, Harry Gural vs. Equity Residential Management and Smith Property Holdings Van Ness LP, 2016-DHCD- TP-30,855 (Dec. 4, 2023)	
167		Other:The final exhibit will be added when it is delivered by the Housing	
168	600	Email from Harry Gural to Avis DuVall, "Violation of DC Rent Control Law," (May 2, 2016) Respondent #000835	
169	601	Email from Harry Gural to Avis DuVall and Jesse Jennell, "Equity Residential – widespread practice of illegal rent increases – falsified document attached," (March 13, 2016) Respondent #004980	

EX #	NEW EX #	ITEMIZED DESCRIPTION	
170	602	Email from Avis Duvall to Jesse Jennell, "Fwd: Equity Residential – widespread practice of illegal rent increases – falsified document attached," (March 15, 2016) <i>Respondent #005011</i>	
171	603	Email from Harry Gural to Marco Cruz, "Re: Balance Due Notification – 3003 Van Ness," (May 12, 2016) <i>Respondent #000840</i>	
172	604	Email from Harry Gural to Avis Duvall, "Court Case," (May 20, 2016) <i>Respondent #005361</i>	
173	605	Email from Avis Duvall to Jesse Jennell, "Fwd: Court Case," (May 20, 2016) <i>Respondent #002433</i>	
174	606	Email from Councilmember Mary Cheh to Harry Gural, Johanna Shreve, and DC Council member offices, "Re: Lease renewal 3003 Van Ness #W1011," (May 22, 2016) <i>Respondent #002434</i>	
175	607	Email from Avis Duvall to Matt Ing, cc: Jesse Jennell and Frances Nolan, "Re: Negative Review Alert – 3003 Van Ness Apartments – Yelp," (May 23, 2016) <i>Respondent #002437</i>	
176	608	Email from Marco Cruz to Harry Gural, cc: Avis Duvall, "Re: Mistake on charge to my account," (June 8, 2016) <i>Respondent #000945</i>	
177	609	Formal letter from Avis Duvall to Harry Gural regarding rent increase (Jan. 15, 2016) <i>Respondent #005181</i>	
178	610	Email from Harry Gural to Avis DuVall, "Perjury," (July 12, 2016) <i>Respondent #005991</i>	
179	611	Email from Avis DuVall to Jesse Jennell, "Fwd: Perjury," (July 13, 2016) <i>Respondent #002892</i>	

EX #	NEW EX #	ITEMIZED DESCRIPTION	
180	612	Email from Harry Gural to Avis DuVall, Jesse Jennell and Marco Cruz, "Fw: Illegal rent increases by Equity Residential – 3003 Van Ness W1011," (June 19, 2016), <i>Respondent # 002493</i>	
181	613	Email from Avis DuVall to Jesse Jennell, "Fwd: Rent Payment," (Oct. 13, 2015), <i>Respondent #001929</i>	
182	614	Email from Jesse Jennell to undisclosed recipients, "Van Ness Harry Gural Response," (Sept. 30, 2015), <i>Respondent #001875</i>	
183	615	Email from Jesse Jennell to Avis Duvall, "Re: Fwd: 3003 Van Ness W404 Rent Increase Notice," (Sept. 22, 2015), <i>Respondent #001825</i>	
184	616	Email from Joel Cohn to Harry Gural, Avis Duvall, Jesse Jennell, Johanna Shreve, and DC Council staff, "RE: 3003 Van Ness W404 Rent Increase Notice," (Sept. 22, 2015) <i>Respondent # 003879</i>	
185	617	Email from Harry Gural to Jesse Jennell, cc: Avis Duvall and city officials, "Re: Another illegal rent increase by Equity Residential – the case of Chary Annaberdiev," (Sept. 30, 2015), <i>Respondent #003995</i>	
186	618	Email from Harry Gural to Avis Duvall, cc: Jesse Jennell, James Purnell and city officials, "Re: Another illegal rent increase by Equity Residential – the case of Chary Annaberdiev," (Oct. 1, 2015) <i>Respondent #004020</i>	
187	619	Email from Harry Gural to Avis Duvall, James Purnell and Jesse Jennell, "Re: Another illegal rent increase by Equity Residential – the case of Chary Annaberdiev," (Oct. 1, 2015) <i>Respondent #004015</i>	

EX #	NEW EX #	ITEMIZED DESCRIPTION	
188	620	Email from Harry Gural to Jesse Jennell, cc: Avis Duvall, James Purnell, Chary Annaberdiev and city officials, "Re: Another illegal rent increase by Equity Residential – the case of Chary Annaberdiev," (Oct. 6, 2015) <i>Respondent #001921</i>	
189	621	Email from Harry Gural to Avis Duvall, cc: Chary Annaberdiev, Johanna Shreve, and city officials, "Re: Rent Payment," (Oct. 13, 2015) <i>Respondent #004110</i>	
190	622	Email from Harry Gural to Avis Duvall and James Purnell, cc: Jesse Jennell, Chary Annaberdiev and city officials, "Re: Another illegal rent increase by Equity Residential – the case of Chary Annaberdiev," (Sept. 29, 2015) <i>Respondent #003963</i>	
191	623	Email from Harry Gural to Avis Duvall, cc: Gabe Fineman and city officials, "Re: Rent Increase W1131," (Oct. 20, 2015) <i>Respondent #004230</i>	
192	624	Email from Avis Duvall to Jesse Jennell, "Gabriel Fineman Letter to DC Office of the Tenant Advocate," (Oct. 13, 2015) <i>Respondent #001959</i>	
193	625	Letter from Gabriel Fineman to Smith Property Holdings Van Ness LP, "RE: Notice to Tenants of Adjustment in Rent Charged unit W-1131," <i>Respondent #001962</i>	EXCLUDED
194	626	Letter from Councilmember Mary Cheh to Joel Cohn of the Office of the Tenant Advocate and Harry Gural, cc: Avis Duvall, Gabe Fineman, Johanna Page 3 Shreve (OTA), DC Council staff and others, "Re: Rent Increase W1131," (Oct. 21, 2015) <i>Respondent #004261</i>	

EX #	NEW EX #	ITEMIZED DESCRIPTION	
195	627	Email from Harry Gural to Avis Duvall, Jesse Jennell, Marco Cruz and James Purnell, cc: senior members of the Bowser administration and the DC Council, "Fwd: Re: Lease renewal 3003 van ness #W1011," (May 18, 2016) <i>Respondent #000893</i>	
196	628	Email from Harry Gural to Avis Duvall, Jesse Jennell and Marco Cruz, cc: DC Councilmembers and senior city officials; "Fw: Illegal rent increases by Equity Residential – 3003 Van Ness W1011," (June 19, 2016) <i>Respondent #000983</i>	
197	629	Email from Avis Duvall to Jesse Jennell, "Re: Charlie & Amelia Finch," (May 20, 2016, 7:50 am) <i>Respondent #002402</i>	
198	630	Email from Avis Duvall to Jesse Jennell, "Re: Charlie and Amelia Finch," (May 20, 2016, 10:13 am) <i>Respondent #000906</i>	
199	631	Housing Provider's Notice to Tenants of Adjustment in Rent Charged, Charlie Finch and Amelia Griffith, (April 20, 2016) <i>Respondent # 000892</i>	EXCLUDED
200	632	Email from Harry Gural to Avis Duvall and Julie Jackson, cc: DC Council staffs and senior Bowser administration officials, "Fwd: W-226 Rent Follow Up," (Aug. 9, 2016) <i>Respondent #002899</i>	
201	633	Housing Provider's Notice to Tenants of Adjustment in Rent Charged, Emma Rehard and Justin Pennisi, (June 20, 2016) <i>Respondent #002902</i>	
202	634	Email from Harry Gural to Avis Duvall, Jesse Jennell and James Purnell, cc: Councilmember Mary Cheh, OTA Director Johanna Shreve, staff of DC Councilmembers, "Illegal rent demanded of Pat Remick in W-705 of 3003 Van Ness," (Sept. 30, 2015) <i>Respondent 001878</i>	

EX #	NEW EX #	ITEMIZED DESCRIPTION	
203	635	Email from Harry Gural to Avis Duvall, Charlie Finch and Amelia Finch, "Re: Rent for Charlie and Amelia Finch," (May 12, 2015) <i>Respondent #001758</i>	
204	636	Email from Harry Gural to Avis Duvall, Jesse Jennell and James Purnell, cc: Ben Serinsky, Samantha Hassard, Councilmember Mary Cheh, Shirley Adelstein, (Sept. 22, 2015) <i>Respondent #001809</i>	
205	637	Email from Avis Duvall to Jesse Jennell, "Fwd: 3003 Van Ness W404 Rent Increase Notice," (Sept. 23, 2015) <i>Respondent #001841</i>	
206	638	Email from James Purnell to Samantha Hassard and Ben Serinsky, "Thank Again for Making 3003 Van Ness Home," (Sept. 15, 2015) <i>Respondent #003902</i>	
207	639	Housing Provider's Notice to Tenants of Adjustment in Rent Charged, Smith Property Holdings Van Ness LP to Benjamin Serinsky and Samantha Hassard, (Sept. 18, 2015) <i>Respondent #003903</i>	EXCLUDED
208	640	Housing Provider's Notice to Tenants of Adjustment in Rent Charged, Smith Property Holdings Van Ness LP rent increase notice to resident Monika Hinterman, Apt. W-621, (Dec. 17, 2015) <i>Respondent #004560</i>	EXCLUDED
209	641	Housing Provider's Notice to Tenants of Adjustment in Rent Charged, Smith Property Holdings Van Ness LP rent increase notice to Edward Sair, Apt. W-931, (Dec 17, 2015) <i>Respondent #004570</i>	EXCLUDED
210	642	Housing Provider's Notice to Tenants of Adjustment in Rent Charged, Smith Property Holdings Van Ness LP rent increase notice to Leon Lewis, Apt. S-409, (Jan. 1, 2015) <i>Respondent #004664</i>	EXCLUDED

EX #	NEW EX #	ITEMIZED DESCRIPTION	
211	643	Housing Provider's Notice to Tenants of Adjustment in Rent Charged, Smith Property Holdings Van Ness LP rent increase notice to Sarah Murran, Apt. S-810, (Jan. 1, 2016) <i>Respondent #004682</i>	EXCLUDED
212	644	Housing Provider's Notice to Tenants of Adjustment in Rent Charged, Smith Property Holdings Van Ness LP rent increase notice to Thomas McGinty, Apt. S-202, (Jan. 15, 2016) <i>Respondent #004692</i>	EXCLUDED
213	645	Housing Provider's Notice to Tenants of Adjustment in Rent Charged, Smith Property Holdings Van Ness LP rent increase notice to Luzelenia Casanova, Apt. W-622, (Jan. 15, 2016) <i>Respondent #004710</i>	EXCLUDED
214	646	Housing Provider's Notice to Tenants of Adjustment in Rent Charged, Smith Property Holdings Van Ness LP rent increase notice to Neary Ung, Apt. S-0109, (Dec. 17, 2015) <i>Respondent #000584</i>	EXCLUDED
215	647	Housing Provider's Notice to Tenants of Adjustment in Rent Charged, Smith Property Holdings Van Ness LP rent increase notice to Mary Jane Maxwell, Apt. W-104, (Dec. 17, 2015) <i>Respondent #00604</i>	EXCLUDED
216	648	Housing Provider's Notice to Tenants of Adjustment in Rent Charged, Smith Property Holdings Van Ness LP rent increase notice to David Hendin, Apt. W-318, (Dec. 17, 2015) <i>Respondent #00614</i>	EXCLUDED
217	649	Housing Provider's Notice to Tenants of Adjustment in Rent Charged, Smith Property Holdings Van Ness LP rent increase notice to Moshe Elmaleh, Apt. W-405, (Dec. 17, 2015) <i>Respondent #00618</i>	EXCLUDED

EX #	NEW EX #	ITEMIZED DESCRIPTION	
218	650	Housing Provider's Notice to Tenants of Adjustment in Rent Charged, Smith Property Holdings Van Ness LP rent increase notice to Marie Brodeur, Apt. W-604, (Jan. 15, 2015) <i>Respondent #003050</i>	EXCLUDED
219	651	Change in Rents Charged Worksheet, Equity Residential for 3003 Van Ness, (Apr. 1, 2016 to Apr. 30, 2016) <i>Respondent #000640-000644</i>	
220	652	Change in Rents Charged Worksheet, Equity Residential for 3003 Van Ness, (Apr. 1, 2016 to Apr. 30, 2015) <i>Respondent #003080-003084</i>	
221	653	Email from Harry Gural to Avis Duvall, cc: Office of the Tenant Advocate, John Falcicchio, and DC Council staff; "Equity's rental practices are illegal – please feel free to sue me," (Apr. 1, 2016) <i>Respondent #000757</i>	
222	654	Email from Harry Gural to Avis Duvall, cc: Jesse Jennel, Marco Cruz, CM Mary Cheh, Johanna Shreve, Joel Cohn, John Falcicchio, and DC Council staff; "Equity's rental practices are illegal – please feel free to sue me," (Apr. 1, 2016) <i>Respondent #000835</i>	
223	655	Letter from Greenstein, DeLorme and Luchs to Harry Gural, "Notice of Landlord's Reservation of Rights," (Apr. 25, 2016), <i>Respondent #005177</i>	
224	656	3003 Van Ness Statement for Harry Gural, (Feb. 1, 2013 to Aug. 6, 2016), <i>Respondent #000279</i>	
225	657	Equity Residential internal log for Harry Gural, (Apr. 27, 2011 to Aug. 31, 2016), <i>Respondent #000325</i>	
226	658	Email from Harry Gural to Avis Duvall, "Rent Increase," (Feb. 8, 2015), <i>Respondent #001723</i>	
227	659	Email from Marco Cruz to Jesse Jennell, "Harry Gural S 707," (June 4, 2015), <i>Respondent #001779</i>	

EX #	NEW EX #	ITEMIZED DESCRIPTION	
228	660	Email from Jesse Jennell to Marco Cruz, "Re: Harry Gural S 707," (June 4, 2015), <i>Respondent #003603</i>	
229	661	Email from Marco Cruz to Jesse Jennell, "Re: Harry Gural S 707," (June 4, 2015), <i>Respondent #003605</i>	
230	662	Email from Jesse Jennell to Marco Cruz, "Re: Harry Gural S 707," (June 4, 2015), <i>Respondent #000203</i>	
231	663	Email from Harry Gural to Marco Cruz, cc: Jesse Jennel and Avis Duvall (Dec. 10, 2015) <i>Respondent #004461</i>	

		HOUSING PROVIDER/RESPONDENT EXHIBITS	
200		Lease for Unit S-707	
201		Ledger for Unit S-707	
202		April 1, 2016 email from Avis Duvall to Harry Gural	
203		April 1, 2016 email from Harry Gural to Avis Duvall	
204		May 13, 2016 email from Jesse Jennell to Harry Gural	
205		Answer to Housing Provider Motion for Summary Judgment and Tenant/Petitioner Motion for Voluntary Dismissal Under OAH Rule 2817.1, Gural v. Smith Property Holdings Van Ness L.P., TP 30,818 (OAH July 27, 2016)	
206		Final Order Dismissing Tenant Petition and Denying Respondent's Motion for Summary Judgment as Moot, Gural v. Smith Property Holdings Van Ness L.P., TP 30,818 (OAH July 27, 2016).	

EX #	NEW EX #	ITEMIZED DESCRIPTION	
207		Plaintiff Equity Residential Management, LLC's Motion to Vacate the Drayton Stay, Equity Residential Management, LLC v. Gural, 2016 LTB 10863, filed August 23, 2016.	
208		Final order on Liability for District of Columbia v. Equity Residential Management, L.L.C., et al, 2017 CA 008334 B, filed April 23, 2021.	
209		Final order on Remedies for District of Columbia v. Equity Residential Management, L.L.C., et al, 2017 CA 008334 B, entered October 8, 2021.	
210		<u>Audio recordings of evidentiary hearing conducted in this litigation on 5-22-2017.</u>	
211		<u>Audio recordings of evidentiary hearing conducted in this litigation on 5-23-2017.</u>	
212		<u>Audio recordings of evidentiary hearing conducted on this litigation on 5-24- 2017.</u>	